	1
1 2 3	RICHLAND COUNTY PLANNING COMMISSION December 4, 2017
4 5 6	[Members Present: Beverly Frierson, Heather Cairns, Stephen Gilchrist, Wallace Brown, Sr., Ed Greenleaf; Absent: Karen Yip, Prentiss McLaurin, Christopher Anderson, David Tuttle]
7	Called to order: 1:18 pm
8	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: I'd like to call the December 4 <sup>th</sup> Planning Commission
9	meeting to order. Please allow me read this into the Record. In accordance with the
10	Freedom of Information Act a copy of the Agenda was sent to radio and TV stations,
11	newspapers, and persons requesting notification, and posted on the bulletin board
12	located in the County Administration office. And we thank all of you for being here
13	today, and Merry Christmas to those that may get outta here before we end the
14	meeting.
15	MS. CAIRNS: Cause we only say Merry Christmas at the end?
16	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: That's right. Exactly. Can I get a motion on the
17	Consent Agenda?
18	MR. BROWN: So moved, Mr. Chairman.
19	MS. CAIRNS: I'd like to make the following amendments to pull items off the
20	Consent Agenda, which means that we will discuss them. Okay, so just –
21	MR. BROWN: I'll hold my motion.
22	MS. CAIRNS: - we are pulling off Case 1., which is Richland Street and Winfield
23	Street; Case 2., which is North Brickyard; Case 3., which is Wilson Boulevard; Case 4.,
24	Sharpe Road; Case 5., which is on Percival; and Case 8., which is the Johnson Marina
25	Road. So what we're leaving on the Consent Agenda which means that we will not have
26	discussion is 910 Farrow Road and 7004 Hilo. So if anyone's here to speak against one

1	of those, we need to know because I didn't have anyone signed up, or if anyone on the
2	Commission wants one of those cases pulled. But other than that we will leave on the
3	Consent Agenda the Minutes, the Road Names, and then those two cases.
4	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay.
5	MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman, I move approval as amended.
6	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, is there a second?
7	MR. GREENLEAF: Second.
8	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, all in favor of approving the Consent Agenda as
9	amended please signify by raising your hand. All opposed?
10	[Approved: Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown, Greenleaf; Absent: Yip, McLaurin,
11	Anderson, Tuttle]
12	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. There are no additions to the Agenda for the
13	Staff?
14	MS. HEGLER: Good afternoon, Chairman. No, no changes.
15	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay.
16	MS. CAIRNS: Merry Christmas. And a Happy New Year.
17	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Merry Christmas. And a Happy New Year. Yes. Case
18	number 1.
19	<u>CASE NO. 17-038 MA</u> :
20	MR. PRICE: The first item is Case 17-038 MA. The Applicant is Jermaine
21	Johnson. The location is 7901 Richard Street and Winfield Road. The Applicant is
22	requesting a rezoning from RS-MD, which is single-family, medium density, to NC,
23	Neighborhood Commercial. Staff's recommendation is for disapproval. Based on the

Comprehensive Plan and looking at the request we feel that this is an encroachment
 into the proposed residential area of the, this community.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Any questions for the Staff? Okay, we do have
persons signed up to speak. When we call your name please come to the podium, give
us your name and your address for the Record. And you have two minutes for your
comments. Jermaine Johnson? He's not here. Is that Audrey Adams? Okay. One
second, Ms. Adams, let's get you mic'd up here. There you go.

## TESTIMONY OF AUDREY ADAMS:

9 MS. ADAMS: Good afternoon, I am Audrey Adams and I reside at 101 Whitmont 10 Street in Columbia in the 29209. I'm a member, a long-time member of the Richard 11 Street community. We were told in our association many years ago when these zoning 12 signs show up, that someone from the neighborhood needs to show up to see what's 13 going on. I will tell you we are a rich old neighborhood and our concerns was when the 14 signs showed up we didn't know what was going on. Of course, the property if it's 15 owned by someone, we very well may not be able to tell them what to do but we sure 16 would like to know what's going on in our neighborhood and that's the reason I came 17 forth. I do see something about a disapproval so I was a little, just wanted to get a 18 clearer understanding so I can carry it back to our community association this afternoon and share with our neighbors as to what we found or what is happening.

19 20 21

8

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Great. Thank you.

MS. ADAMS: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Absolutely. Commissioners, that's all we have signedup to speak on this case. Questions, comments?

1	MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman, if it's in order I'd like to move that the, that 17-038
2	MA sent forward to Council with a recommendation of disapproval.
3	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: There's a motion, is there a second?
4	MR. GREENLEAF: Second.
5	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, great. It's been moved and properly seconded
6	that we send Case No. 17-038 MA forward to Council with a recommendation of
7	disapproval. All in favor signify by raising your hand. Do you need to call rollcall?
8	MR. PRICE: Yes, sir.
9	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay.
10	MR. PRICE: Those in favor: Greenleaf, Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown.
11	[Approved: Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown, Greenleaf; Absent: Yip, McLaurin,
12	Anderson, Tuttle]
13	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, I think that's a unanimous vote. We are a
14	recommending Body to County Council and they will meet back in these Chambers, is
15	that December 19 <sup>th</sup> , is that right?
16	MS. HEGLER: That's correct.
17	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, December the 19 <sup>th</sup> , and feel free to share with
18	your neighborhood group that they're able to come back at that time to hear what the
19	Council will determine on this case at that time. Okay?
20	MS. HEGLER: Chairman, do you – can we tell Ms. Adams, you know, what the
21	request was for so maybe she can take that back?
22	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, please.

MS. HEGLER: Just briefly Ms. Adams, the Applicant at that address was wanting to rezone from a residential zoning district to a neighborhood commercial. And the recommendation from this Body was to disapprove.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Disapprove that, yeah. Okay. Thank you. Alrighty.

#### CASE NO. 17-039 MA:

1

2

3

4

5

6 MR. PRICE: The next item is Case 17-039 MA. The Applicant is Troy Berry and 7 the location is 1215 N. Brickyard Road. The Applicant is requesting a rezoning from single-family, low density which is RS-LD, to Neighborhood Commercial which is NC. 8 9 Staff's recommendation was for disapproval and it was based primarily on, on our 10 opinion that it would be out of character with the surrounding development pattern of the 11 area which is primarily residential, and also we felt that the request would initiate a 12 spread of commercial zoning into an area which is more suitable for transitional zoning. 13 This is, we really looked at this one and I think going forward, Commission, I think this 14 is, this is probably one of the start of a number of cases y'all may have in this particular 15 area because as we looked with the widening of Hardscrabble Road that's really gonna 16 kind of change the character of that area. And so while it may be a little easier as we 17 look at some of the potential rezoning cases off of Hardscrabble Road, which would be 18 part of a probably four or five lane road, it's going to be the side streets of where we're 19 gonna allow commercial to kind of transition from there to the existing development 20 pattern of those areas. So this is kind of, I guess maybe your first crack at this particular 21 type of request.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Any additional questions for the Staff? Again, we do have some persons signed up to speak and we'll ask that you give us your name and your address for the Record. Troy Berry, the Applicant?

4 **TESTIMONY OF TROY BERRY**:

1

2

3

5 MR. BERRY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. I am the 6 Applicant, Troy Berry, and I am a owner and member in the property, and I have always 7 lived in this area of Northeast Columbia, around Hardscrabble Road and N. Brickyard 8 Road area. And I reside at 548 Charleston Estates Lane, which is about a half a mile 9 away from this site. At this moment I would like to state that there is no opposition from 10 the area community. This is a service to the community and all the community is in 11 support of and in favor of this here. There was about five people that have signed up 12 today in support of it. And Tommy has some additional information, it's some talking 13 points in support of this motion. While Tommy's handing that out on the seven main 14 talking points for this case, as a note I'm the Applicant and I only received this here one 15 business day before today's meeting. So basically I had all day Friday to scramble once 16 I saw the initial notes from the Staff Report of disapproval to try to clear up some 17 information. So if, I don't know if Tommy's handed out this seven – I'm not gonna read it 18 all, you have it in front of you, it's the same seven major talking points in support. But 19 initially I think Staff may have potentially been rushed in this here and they did not have 20 some clear information in their report, and I had a very good conversation with Mr. Geo 21 Price and Tommy Friday afternoon which cleared up some information regarding the 22 roads and traffic and some other facts. So I believe if Staff had some additional time on 23 this case they would've recommended approval or, or could have been as no

recommendation provided by Staff based on their rushed decision. And I apologize for my voice, I have a very bad sinus infection for the past four weeks, so please bear with me.

1

2

3

4

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: You're doing fine.

5 MR. BERRY: As you'll see in point number 1 on the notes in support of this case, 6 the Comprehensive Plan of two years ago with the Commission here and Staff, is 7 Neighborhood Commercial is a service to the residential area and that's what it's for is 8 to help support the people living in the residential areas and provide that service. And in 9 this case here, this is a professional daycare learning center that's been in business in 10 Richland County approximately three miles away from this site on Farrow Road, and it's 11 a learning center. Primary age of kids is 3, 4, and 5 years of age, it's like a pre-k 12 learning center. And they are relocating to this site which is a two acre tract of land at N. 13 Brickyard Road, approximately 600' from the intersection of Hardscrabble Road. 14 Because this site is better suited as a safer environment for the learning center for 15 daycare, and a better location for the kids and this learning program. So it's a safe 16 environment for them. Point number 2 -

17 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Mr. Berry, I'm gonna have to ask you to kinda wrap it
18 up. We will be happy to come back to you if we have some additional questions from
19 the Staff, but we wanna give the other persons an opportunity now. If they wanna defer
20 some of their time to you, you're welcome to do that.

MR. BERRY: You have the seven talking points in front of you –

21

22

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, sir, we do.

1 MR. BERRY: - the talking point I was making is this conforms to the area, there is 2 no opposition from the community.

3

4

5

6

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Sure. Thank you.

MR. BERRY: And this has been discussed with Councilmembers Kennedy and Manning and they are supportive and have no opposition.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, sir. We appreciate that. Christopher Jones?

#### 7 **TESTIMONY OF CHRISTOPHER JONES:**

8 MR. JONES: Merry Christmas, everybody. Merry Christmas, everybody! Thank 9 you. Thank you. My name is Chris Jones. I'm gonna defer my minutes to Mr. Troy 10 Berry, but before I even do that, my wife is the, is the predecessor of this, this project. 11 She is an extraordinary person, a person that's trying to motivate and make things 12 better, accelerate our kids in education. She's serious about what she does, she loves 13 kids, and you know, that's the bottom line, love, dedication. And I just wanna give those 14 minutes to Mr. Troy Berry now. Thank you.

15 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, Mr. Jones. Jessica Jones? Please give us 16 your name and your address for the Record, please.

17

# **TESTIMONY OF JESSICA JONES:**

18 MS. JONES: Okay. Jessica Jones, 238 Castlebury Drive, Columbia, South Carolina 29229. Great day and good afternoon, Commission. I just wanted you guys to 19 20 know that Magnanimous Kids is my heart and I developed the program myself. I've 21 been teaching through Child Care Services for the past 11 years. Prior to that I was 22 teaching in Alaska because we were a military family. After working in a school is when 23 I realized the love for teaching that I have and the love for children, of course, cause I

1	have three of my own as well. I have an established business that strives to provide the	
2	daily needs of a safe, loving, and an educational quality childcare environment to the	
3	families of the surrounding communities. Again, I have been servicing the community for	
4	the past 11 years. When my children leave me, my children leave me with an above	
5	reading average level of a 2 <sup>nd</sup> grade level reading, or either 1 <sup>st</sup> grade. My children do	
6	not ever test out for the Richland County's pre-k program, no offense. My experience as	
7	a director, facility manager, and owner will also ensure full compliance with the	
8	neighboring community as I have at the previous location that we were in. In efforts of	
9	relocating my business I believe I finally found a place in close proximity that provides	
10	all these attributes for my children. It would be an absolute honor to have the	
11	Committee's full support in the opening of our learning center at this location. Thank you	
12	in advance of your time and consideration. For the remainder of my time I would like to	
13	defer it to Mr. Berry if that would be okay.	
14	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: That's fine.	
15	MS. JONES: Thank you.	
16	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, sir, Mr. Brown?	
17	MR. BROWN: Ma'am? Let me ask you. Where is your daycare currently located?	
18	MS. JONES: At 10114 Farrow Road.	
19	MR. BROWN: On Farrow Road.	
20	MS. JONES: Yes, sir.	
21	MR. BROWN: Thank you.	
22	MS. JONES: Alright.	
23	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Gwyn Berry.	
		l

1	MR. BERRY: That would be me, Mr. Chairman. That's my mother and she
2	resides adjacent to this tract of land, and Tommy has the original authorization as her
3	personal agent that's representative of her and to speak on her behalf, and that she is
4	requesting for support from the Commission and approval on this case.
5	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, sir.
6	MR. BERRY: That's the original letter as an authorized agent to speak on her
7	behalf. And I would defer any time to address all questions at the very end you may
8	have.
9	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you. Jennifer Glass? Is that? Okay.
10	MR. BERRY: Once again, Mr. Chairman, Jennifer Glass, that is my sister.
11	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, if she's not here that, that's –
12	MR. BERRY: Correct. She is an owner in this site and property.
13	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, I appreciate it. That's all we have signed up
14	to speak, Commissioners. Questions, comments? I do have a question for the Staff.
15	This, where is – you know, I miss being able to look up at the – I like the renovations of
16	the Chambers but I like to be able to look at that – yeah. The – where is Northsprings
17	Road here? Where?
18	MR. PRICE: You're trying to identify where this is exactly?
19	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: No, where is Northsprings running to, from N.
20	Brickyard? I'm just trying to visualize this on this map, but I can't – where, I mean,
21	where, which side of this thing would it be?
22	MR. PRICE: This would be west of Northsprings Road.

1	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. And it is my understanding that there is some
2	work going on on that section of, that road, is it not? Some penny work, is that right?
3	MR. PRICE: On Northsprings?
4	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes.
5	MR. PRICE: There was some work going on that I'm aware of at the corner of
6	Northsprings – I'm sorry, let me make sure I'm saying this correctly.
7	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Right.
8	MR. BERRY: Mr. Chairman, I may be able to help you with that.
9	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Excuse me, sir. We, we'll call you back up if we need
10	to.
11	MR. BERRY: Okay. This is N. Brickyard Road, just as clarification, not
12	Northsprings.
13	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: No, I know what it is.
14	MS. HEGLER: Are you seeing this on the monitor in front of you?
15	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Well, it's real tiny. We can barely see it, yeah.
16	MS. HEGLER: Okay.
17	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Can we blow it up or something?
18	MS. CAIRNS: Also a certain lack of context when it's zoomed in.
19	MS. HEGLER: We were gonna pull it up but I didn't wanna do that if you
20	[inaudible]. It'd be nice to have one of those things, but.
21	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Right. While you're doing that are they the – Mr.
22	Greenleaf?

1	MR. GREENLEAF: Mr. Chairman, on this particular case, this is no offense to the
2	speaker, thank you Mr. Berry for coming, I wanna propose that the Staff step back for a
3	moment and develop a plan for us as Commissioners to use as a guideline for the area.
4	Otherwise we're gonna have this thing happen over and over again of the whole
5	community, one parcel at a time and it's gonna take a lot of resources for y'all and a
6	lotta resources from the community to kinda hear other cases when it's gonna be the
7	same thing over and over and over again for – how many parcels, 100? I mean, how
8	many parcels are we talking about? I mean, look at this, it's crazy. I don't wanna go
9	through this one by one over and over again. I'd like Staff to develop a plan for that
10	intersection and move forward. And until then let's defer all cases.
11	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Ms. Cairns?
12	MS. CAIRNS: I mean, I'll speak on that. Basically that's what the Comprehensive
13	Plan is about.
14	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Right.
15	MS. CAIRNS: And typically in Richland County, and I don't know where else, it's
16	very rare that we do proactive zoning and change people's zoning without their input.
17	So I understand the desire to be efficient but that's what the Comprehensive Plan is our
18	guidance for doing that.
19	MR. GREENLEAF: We can also change that.
20	MS. CAIRNS: That would take legislation I believe. So.
21	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: You know, this is a unique case given what is
22	transpiring in that area of the County. And obviously – do we know the completion date
23	of the Hardscrabble expansion?

	13
1	MR. PRICE: I wanna say it's probably at least another two years.
2	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Two years?
3	MR. BERRY: Mr. Chairman, I can address that.
4	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Sir, please. We'll, if we have to, we'll call you back if
5	we need –
6	MR. BERRY: Well, I have the facts from the DOT.
7	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: I need my Staff to respond to that for me, please, if you
8	don't mind. Thank you.
9	MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman?
10	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, sir, Mr. Brown?
11	MR. BROWN: Is there a plan for Farrow Road? If Farrow Road is gonna remain
12	a two-lane road is that pretty much what you're saying, Mr. Price?
13	MS. HEGLER: I'm not sure, we can pull up the penny list though and get that
14	answer for you. I don't recall if there was a [inaudible] on Farrow. But we'll look that up.
15	MR. GREENLEAF: Mr. Chairman, there's 41 properties on either side of
16	Hardscrabble and the intersection of N. Brickyard, it's 41 properties. We're gonna do
17	this 41 times, really? That's just for that corner. That doesn't go down to Sloan Road.
18	I'm gonna vote against it simply for the fact that I don't wanna do this over and over
19	again. Sorry. Proactive zoning is what we need, we need proactive zoning.
20	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: And I think that's part of the conversation, which is one
21	of the reasons why it's important for what we're doing with the Code rewrite to help
22	address some of that.
23	MR. GREENLEAF: Exactly. Thank you.

1

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Ms. Cairns, you had a comment?

MS. CAIRNS: Well, I was just – I mean, the plans for Hardscrabble and what happens there, I mean, I personally would hope it just becomes this – just because it becomes a four lane road it doesn't become another endless commercial corridor. But in terms of this property going to Neighborhood Commercial, the nature of Neighborhood Commercial being something that serves the neighborhood, I mean, so the Comprehensive Plan was to have this as just stay residential cause it's not at the

MS. HEGLER: I think it's more, if you look at the intent of the Neighborhood Commercial being within and adjacent to neighborhoods, you know, Staff was just of the opinion that contextually that didn't fit that model. And again, we come back to what we're trying to address with the Code rewrite, this conundrum we find ourselves in over and over again. I agree with you, Neighborhood Commercial doesn't to me say, massive commercial corridor and you see it everywhere. But when you say, when we have language that says it needs to be within or adjacent to a neighborhood, I just didn't, we just didn't see that context in this location.

MS. CAIRNS: I gotcha.

MS. HEGLER: But that's a Staff opinion.

19 MS. CAIRNS: So in terms of the fact that because immediately around this are 20 still just the large lots -

MS. CAIRNS: - as opposed to the subdivisions that aren't very, I mean, that are sort of lot by lot subdivisions that aren't very far away. I gotcha. So this was almost too rural-ish to be Neighborhood Commercial.

MS. HEGLER: Oddly enough. We know it's changing, so that's where -

MS. CAIRNS: I gotcha.

MS. HEGLER: - and getting to Mr. Greenleaf's comment, I mean, that is certainly within your purview to start thinking about those things which is why Mr. Price brought it up. This is not gonna be the last time you hear this. The Comprehensive Plan is that high level guidance but when we do our Code rewrite, I – but I would say it's your vision as to how you want to grow along Hardscrabble, not, not entirely ours to plan. That's within your purview.

MS. CAIRNS: And I know the other thing I wanted to sort of comment to a little bit and, I mean, not that there's any opposition *per se* on this, but in terms of the specific use and the individual who plans to open a business there, that is not something that we can take into account. When we rezone it's to a classification of potential uses, so this would not be rezoned to be a daycare for this person, we don't have that – we can't, under our powers granted by the government, have the level of specificity. What we can say is that this could go to Neighborhood Commercial and then there's a whole listing of uses. So whether we vote for or against something it's not an indictment or a support of the particular use that somebody says, this is what's gonna come, become tomorrow, we have to consider all of the potential uses under that classification. So you know, I don't, it just, I think it's important because if we were to support Staff recommendation of

1	disapproval it would never be anything specific about the property owner, the intended
2	use or that, it's the fact that the range of uses we found inconsistent.
3	MS. HEGLER: Chairman, if I – Mr. Brown, on your screen is a list of the penny
4	projects, there appears to be no widenings slated for Farrow Road.
5	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay.
6	MR. BROWN: Thank you.
7	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Alright, any other comments or questions for Staff?
8	We've closed it, man, I'm sorry.
9	MR. BERRY: There was a lot of minutes of time left for public comments.
10	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: If the Commission doesn't have any comments, sir,
11	that's it. Thank you.
12	MR. BERRY: I have two points I'd like to make; the DOT information they had in
13	their Staff Report –
14	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Sir, please. We, we've asked you. We have a lot of
15	people signed up to speak for other things.
16	MR. BERRY: Okay. I'll request your full support and approval.
17	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you. Motions?
18	MR. GREENLEAF: Mr. Chairman, I move that we, Staff recommendation to
19	disapprove this rezoning.
20	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Is there a second? Motion dies for lack of a second.
21	Other motion?
22	MS. CAIRNS: I'd like to make a motion to send Map Amendment 17-039 MA
23	forward to Council with a recommendation of approval. And the reason for going against

1	Staff recommendation is while, you know, respecting that this is still sitting as a	
2	fundamentally rural area, that it is in a ever-developing area and that a Neighborhood	
3	Commercial classification is appropriate to drop into residential areas in situations like	
4	this. So I would make a motion for approval.	
5	MR. BROWN: Second.	
6	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, it's been moved and properly seconded that we	
7	send Case No. 17-039 MA forward to Council with a recommendation of approval per	
8	the comments of Commissioner Cairns. Was Staff able to get that? Okay. All in favor of	
9	this motion signify by raising your hand.	
10	MR. PRICE: Those in favor: Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown.	
11	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Opposed?	
12	MR. PRICE: Opposed: Greenleaf.	
13	[Approved: Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown; Opposed: Greenleaf; Absent: Yip,	
14	McLaurin, Anderson, Tuttle]	
15	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: And we are a recommending Body to County Council.	
16	They will meet back in these Chambers again on December the 19 <sup>th</sup> , and at that time	
17	feel free to come back and share with them at that time. Thank you. Alright, next case.	
18	<u>CASE NO. 17-040 MA</u> :	
19	MR. PRICE: The next item is Case 17-040 MA. The Applicant is Donald	
20	McDaniel, the location is 8612 Wilson Boulevard. The Applicant is requesting a rezoning	
21	from rural to LI, which is Light Industrial. Staff recommended disapproval of this request.	
22	We didn't feel it was appropriate with the objectives outlined in the Comprehensive	
23	Plan. And also according to the Plan, Commercial uses should be developed at a	

neighborhood scale and considered for location along main road corridors and within a
 contextually appropriate distance from the intersection of a primary arterial. The
 proposed zoning does not promote neighborhood-scaled development, nor is it located
 along a main road. And for these reasons Staff recommended disapproval.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Questions, comments from Staff? We do have some persons signed up to speak on this case. When we call your name please give us your name and your address for the Record. Donald McDaniel, the Applicant? Okay. Rubin Davis, Jr.? The next person that's up is, is this Ruly Davis? Ruby Davis, okay.

## TESTIMONY OF RUBIN DAVIS, JR.:

5

6

7

8

9

MR. DAVIS: Yes, thank you Chairman and the Staff. My name is Rubin Davis,
just retired military here and we've been approximately, a little over 44 years at 121
Fairlawn Court, just beside Lake Elizabeth. And we are just here to find out more about,
to hear more, she was taking some notes about why it was disapproved. And we carried
back to anyone who inquire, we let them know the reason it was disapproved. Yeah.

# 15 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, sir.

MR. DAVIS: I wanna thank the Staff, too.

17 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Ms. Ruby Davis, you wanna say anything? You got a18 minute to talk too, if you want.

MS. DAVIS: That's all, we just have that concern. We have that concern so wewould like to understand it better.

21

22

16

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, ma'am. Okay. You bet. Thank you. Todd Catoe? <u>TESTIMONY OF TODD CATOE</u>:

1	MR. CATOE: Good afternoon. I'm Todd Catoe at 14 New Holland Circle,
2	Columbia, South Carolina 29203. As a resident of the Summerhill Community which sits
3	just between Hardscrabble Road and where this piece of property is, we have a concern
4	about the influx of commercial traffic being that it's slated from what we understand to
5	become a commercial parking area for dump tracks, tractor trailers, etc. Coming from a
6	residential perspective with a high school right there, that is an issue for me and a
7	concern on a two-lane road, as well as from a law enforcement perspective where I
8	have worked blind curves and the fatalities that come with that with commercial motor
9	vehicles in these types of areas. And it is my position that we should, I go with the
10	recommendation that it be disapproved from a standpoint as a resident and from a law
11	enforcement perspective.
12	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, Mr. Catoe.
13	MR. CATOE: Thank you. It is a public safety concern.
14	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, sir. Susanne Cecere. Next up is Donald
15	Caldwell. Did I get that last name wrong? Okay.
16	MR. PRICE: Cecere.
17	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Cecere.
18	TESTIMONY OF SUSANNE CECERE:
19	MS. CECERE: Hello, Mr. Chairman.
20	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: How are you?
21	MS. CECERE: Commissioners. My concern, my name is Susanne Cecere, 8412
22	Wilson Boulevard, Columbia, South Carolina 29203. My concern is that we are basically
23	still a rural community. I live next door to Summerhill and I'm within, like a city block of

1 this planned development for truck parking. Up to a couple of years ago I still had 2 horses, but I don't now, but some of my neighbors do. It's - we all have problems just 3 coming in and out of our driveways on Wilson Boulevard, it's very congested with the 4 new subdivisions going up. Also, there, the other concern is that there're already two or 5 three parking areas for trucks on Wilson Boulevard and Farrow Road, so I don't think 6 that we need another one, especially in the neighborhood like Summerhill. They will 7 actually, their backyards will back up to this piece of property. And I think County 8 Council in their prior wisdom have already designated some areas that are going to be 9 zoned for light industrial, so once you consider putting something else like light 10 industrial in there, what prevents this – if this property goes belly up, this business goes 11 belly up, then what we're exposed to, anything really. I've looked up all the things that 12 can go in in light industrial. So I request that the Planning Commission deny this use of 13 this property and it continue to be rural. Thank you, Commission.

14 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, Ms. Susanne. Donald Caldwell. Next up,
15 Margaret Perkins.

16

## TESTIMONY OF DONALD CALDWELL:

MR. CALDWELL: My name is Donald Caldwell. I reside at 113 New Holland
Drive, Columbia, South Carolina. That's in the Summerhill subdivision. And I am
Summerhill Homeowners Association president. My concern is the amount of traffic that
we already have on Wilson Boulevard. Okay, we have a high school at the top of the hill
and we have a bridge at the bottom of the hill that's under construction, that's not
planned to be opened I think until April. Okay, Summerhill has two entrances, two exits.
We already have difficulty entering and exiting the neighborhood. If we put a tractor

trailer storage facility there it will only create more traffic and it would create a hazard for
 those people driving Wilson Boulevard as well as for the residents of the Summerhill
 Homeowners Association. Okay? I agree with the disapproval that's already there.
 Thank you, sir.

5

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, Mr. Caldwell. Margaret Perkins, and –

# 6 **TESTIMONY OF MARGARET PERKINS**:

MS. PERKINS: My name is Margaret Perkins. I live at 616 Wilmette Road,
Columbia, South Carolina. I agree with Staff's recommendation. I don't think anyone
would want truck parking and the noise that they make, and houses are right next to
them, pulling in and out in the mornings or in the afternoons or anytime of the day. So I
think it's very inappropriate because there're houses there to have a truck parking
facility right next door to a house. Also, there's truck parking, as someone has already
said, at the service stations that are a mile down the road. Thank you.

14 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you. Cheryl – and I can't – L-E – what is it?

15 Lisethe, alright. And Caesar Lisethe, you're next. I'll go ahead and say that now.

16 TESTIMONY OF CHERYL LISETHE:

MS. LISETHE: That's alright. And I apologize, I've had laryngitis for the last twoor three days.

19

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: That's perfectly fine.

MS. LISETHE: But I wanted to take this opportunity to come and thank you for
this opportunity. I agree with the disapproval. I am Cheryl Lisethe and I live at 205
Summerhill Drive, and I am in the Summerhill division. My backyard is faced right
against the property that they're talking about commercializing. Well, when we came in,

1 this is my husband behind me, we came in from out of town and I woke up one morning 2 and I saw all of this cleared space and it's usually a wooded area. And we've lived in the 3 neighborhood over 40 years. I got really concerned because I thought maybe they were 4 building new houses. Well I got a postcard from Caldwell Bankers saying that the 5 property had been sold to a commercial agency and it was gonna be some kinda 6 trucking agency. And I said, oh no, that brought a red light right then because this is 7 right at my backyard. Now if there were homes that were being built I would say, okay. 8 But if we're opening this up for commercial right at our back door, I'm not sure of what 9 this is, the noise level, the traffic. We don't know what this is bringing to our community, 10 it's not fit. And I think that it should be disapproved. And I'll let my husband talk.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you. Mr. Caesar.

# **TESTIMONY OF CEASAR LISETHE:**

11

12

13 MR. LISETHE: Caesar Lisethe, 201 Summerhill Drive, Columbia, South Carolina 14 29203. And I agree with those that have come before me and stated some things about 15 the traffic, the noise, the property encroachment and the public safety. And like I want 16 to, and what I wanna add to it is that it'll probably be an eyesore as well because you 17 got all this trucks coming in and out and you're gonna have disparity between the 18 houses that are already there and so you got something different and something unique 19 that will bring the property value down as well as probably increase our taxes because if 20 you tax that light industrial organization, then more than likely they're gonna tax us, too, 21 because we live in that area. And so I concur with the disapproval. Thank you. 22 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, sir. Representative Joe McEachern.

# 23 **TESTIMONY OF REPRESENTATIVE JOE MCEACHERN**:

1 REP. MCEACHERN: Commissioners, Mr. Chairman and the rest of the Members 2 of the Richland County Planning Commission, first of all it's a privilege to be before you 3 on this day. I believe the last time I came before this Commission I tried to share what 4 we are faced with in this area and this area is gonna continue to be that challenge. If 5 you look at Hardscrabble Road, and you're absolutely correct, it's gonna be very 6 challenging from this point forward when it expands and what you put there, when 7 you're looking at Wilson Boulevard and as the road begin to prepare, repair over a 8 couple years – and this is right down the road from that by the way, from that area. Also 9 we have a bus terminal, school bus terminal right down the street from there where our 10 buses gonna be going from there. And of course they already mentioned Keenan High 11 School. In the disapproval suggestion by the Planning Staff we strongly agree with that 12 because they really got some very good points on that disapproval, and I will not go 13 over those points again. But what I will say on this is, is that we're just basically 14 disappointed that someone would suggest that kinda zoning change in this area 15 because of the fact is, is that it's so out of character, is that it would just be detrimental 16 for that area. Even just for the – we're looking at what the proposed business is, but 17 look at the scope of just what all can go into light industrial in that area. And so matter of 18 fact the recommendation, I mean, the, your, the plan itself suggest no density for this 19 area. You go from low density to a, to a zoning request of light industrial and we're just 20 extremely disappointed in that. The main things that we continue to fight in this area and 21 we just continuously to ask for your continuously attention to is that it's very challenging. 22 And we're gonna continue to be back, we're gonna have, still have another one on 23 there, and so we just ask as you plan for the future for this area to please us

1	consideration because this area is very demanding and we've been here for a lot.
2	Thank you for your time and consideration, and just, just show support on the
3	disapproval recommendation from the Staff. And we're disappointed that the Applicant
4	didn't come and give us more information on his proposal for this area, and we take that
5	to be very disappointing.
6	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, Representative McEachern. Rubin
7	Galloway?
8	MR. GALLOWAY: I'll just, I'll defer. I don't have anything.
9	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Thank you. That's all we have signed up to
10	speak. Staff, let me ask you a question. The – Wilson Boulevard was, correct me if I'm
11	wrong, one of the areas that was actually impacted by the flooding, was that right, is
12	that right?
13	MS. HEGLER: Yes.
14	MS. CAIRNS: That's the lake that's gone. That lake's no longer there.
15	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Excuse me for one second. And, and there's still
16	some improvements to be done there, right?
17	MS. HEGLER: Right.
18	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Alright.
19	MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman?
20	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, sir, Mr. Brown?
21	MR. BROWN: I'd like to move that 17-040 MA be sent forward to County Council
22	with a recommendation of disapproval for the reasons stated by the Staff.
23	MS. FRIERSON: Second.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. It's been moved and properly seconded that we
 send Case No. 17-040 MA forward to Council with a recommendation of disapproval. All
 in favor signify by raising your hand.

MR. PRICE: Those in favor: Greenleaf, Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown. CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. And none opposed. Again, we are a recommending Body to County Council, they will meet back in these chambers on December the 19<sup>th</sup>. Thank you. Alright, next case.

## CASE NO. 17-041 MA:

4

5

6

7

8

9 MR. PRICE: Alright, the next item is Case 17-041 MA. The Applicant is Bruce 10 Gleaton, the location is 742 Sharpe Road. The Applicant is requesting rezoning the 11 property from GC to RS-E. Staff recommended approval on this one. This is one, if you 12 go specifically by the objectives of the Comprehensive Plan, it suggests that this is a 13 mixed residential area and should provide a mix of densely developed housing 14 opportunities within individual developments preferably organized around a 15 neighborhood center or public space. However, one of the things we looked at was 16 looking at the area and the surrounding development pattern and we feel that approval 17 of the rezoning would not be out of character with the existing development pattern of 18 the area and the existing zoning districts. And we believe that this actually would meet 19 the intent of the Comprehensive Plan. Staff recommends approval.

MS. HEGLER: And Chairman, let me just note, I think there's a typo in the
Agenda cover that says our recommendation was disapproval. That is not correct.
MR. PRICE: Yes, it should be for approval.

1 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, thank you. Okay, any questions for the Staff? 2 We do have a couple of persons signed up to speak. Please, when you come up we ask 3 that you give us your name and your address for the Record. Bruce Gleaton, the 4 Applicant? 5 **TESTIMONY OF BRUCE GLEATON:** 6 MR. GLEATON: Good afternoon, how y'all doing today? I'm Bruce Gleaton, I 7 reside at 1301 Omega Drive, that's Columbia, South Carolina. I was interested in getting this piece of property to perhaps build a home on it, you know, to change from 8 9 what it's so-called as commercial now to residential, you know, because I think it's a 10 nice place to live, you know, with the surrounding homes, you know, for great family 11 gathering. You know, and that was my interest, to move forward with just building a 12 home there. If we can get it approved. 13 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, sir. Any questions for the Applicant, 14 anybody? Okay, Toby Drucker? 15 MR. DRUCKER: He spoke – I'm the realtor for both sides of this. 16 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, thank you, sir. James Green? 17 MR. GREEN: I'm the current owner and I retract my – 18 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Representative McEachern. 19 TESTIMONY OF REPRESENTATIVE JOE MCEACHERN: 20 REP. MCEACHERN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. There was no objection from the 21 community for this. They had some questions in reference, cause it's a challenging area 22 as far as the traffic flow and that kinda thing. If it's gonna be one resident there, I mean, 23 that really don't cause a problem at all, but because of the fact of the change to the

1	zoning designation is what they was looking at, and they didn't have, even with that they
2	didn't have objection to the zoning change. They were just looking at the challenge for
3	the traffic flow where it's coming out. And so we just ask that, you know, if that's gonna
4	be it just kinda let the Highland Forest Subdivision is across from there and it's right
5	next to an intersection, it deads-end right there, it's very challenging for, you know, a
6	lotta traffic coming out for the buses. But if one resident, I mean, I'm sure they don't
7	have a problem with that, it's just the fact if they just keep that communication open.
8	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, Representative McEachern. Okay, that's all
9	we have to speak on this case.
10	MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman?
11	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, sir, Mr. Brown?
12	MR. BROWN: I move that 17-041 MA be sent forward to County Council with the
13	recommendation of approval.
14	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Is there a second?
15	MR. GREENLEAF: Second.
16	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, it's been moved and properly seconded that we
17	send Case No. 17-041 MA forward to Council with a recommendation of approval. All in
18	favor signify by raising your hand.
19	MR. PRICE: Those in favor: Greenleaf, Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown.
20	[Approved: Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown, Greenleaf; Absent: Yip, McLaurin,
21	Anderson, Tuttle]

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: And again, we are a recommending Body to County Council. They will meet back in these Chambers on December the 19<sup>th</sup>. Thank you all. Next case, 17 -

## CASE NO. 17-042 MA:

1

2

3

4

5 MR. PRICE: The next case is 17-042 MA. The Applicant is Avon Banks, the 6 location is 5071 Percival Road. The Applicant is requesting to rezone the property from 7 RM-HD which is residential, multi-family, high density, to Office and Institutional, the OI 8 zoning designation. Again, Staff's recommendation, and this one is correct, but Staff's 9 recommendation is for disapproval, and in your Staff Report you'll see that it's 10 principally because it's not consistent with the objectives of the Comprehensive Plan for 11 that area. One of the things that Staff looked, we just kind of looked at the area as a 12 whole, kind of as we use the term pocket area, so we wanted just to kind of give more of 13 an expanded view. And we feel that it may be consistent with the development pattern 14 of the area and in addition it would meet the purpose of the proposed rezoning district 15 as to character of the area as neither commercial nor exclusively residential. So if you 16 kind of look out off of Percival Road, this is right near Screaming Eagle where you have 17 the landfill, you also have I guess a couple of borrow pits, there's some large lots there, 18 so we just kinda felt just looking at this it may be more appropriate. Again, while Staff 19 recommended denial it was just based on the Comprehensive Plan, however, we feel if 20 you just take another look at it it may be appropriate to support this request.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: That structure on the site currently.

MR. PRICE: Church.

21

22

23

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: That's a church.

MR. PRICE: That's a place of worship, I think the Applicant can speak more to it, but I think primarily this is for their future use of the property.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Alright, well we have a couple of folks signed up to speak. Again, when we call your name please give us your name and your address for the Record. It's Robert – last name?

## **TESTIMONY OF ROBERT ?**:

7 MR. ROBERT: Thank you, Mr. Chair, for – excuse my voice – thank you, Mr. Chair, for giving us the opportunity to come in and ask for approval regarding this. Our 8 9 mission there at International Praise is, from destruction to victory, and to love God, love 10 others and reach the world, and to meet the needs of our congregation from the cradle 11 to the grave. And we're not asking to build additional buildings currently. We currently 12 have 1,000 members, over 1,000 members there. We're proposing this because we 13 want to establish a daycare for our congregation, but also for our community. We 14 currently have 45,000 square feet of facilities which is state of the art with lots of 15 security to make sure that we'd be able to facilitate this. This is a part of our vision when 16 we moved out there in 2006. We, within a four mile radius of us currently we have a 17 residential care assisted facility, living facility, we have a BP, a furniture sales and 18 rental, waste management, Clothing World, BMX track, churches, storage units, 19 apartments, car dealership, Companion Health Care and Blue Cross/Blue Shield. So in 20 reality we, I know that this is residential, I can't remember the – what's that medium 21 residential, is that what it's called? High density if you will. Though I know it's zoned for 22 that I still feel that this would fit, if you will, in meeting the needs of not only our

1	congregation but also meeting the needs of the community as well. Therefore, I'm
2	asking for a reconsideration for approval.
3	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, sir. Any questions?
4	MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman?
5	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, sir?
6	MR. BROWN: It's my understanding that within the designated area there's a
7	lake that's there and then the building that's there, that's the church.
8	MR. ROBERT: Yes, sir.
9	MR. BROWN: And what is desired is to put the daycare facility somewhere
10	behind the church, is that –
11	MR. ROBERT: No, sir, it would be established in the current facilities.
12	MR. BROWN: In the current facilities.
13	MR. ROBERT: Yes, sir.
14	MR. BROWN: Where the church is.
15	MR. ROBERT: Yes, sir.
16	MR. BROWN: Okay, thank you.
17	MR. ROBERT: It would be housed within the 45,000 square feet that we're
18	currently residing in.
19	MR. BROWN: Of the existing structure.
20	MR. ROBERT: Yes, sir.
21	MR. BROWN: Okay. Thank you.
22	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Thank you, sir. Evan Banks?
23	MR. BANKS: I defer.

	31
1	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Alright. That's all we have signed up to speak.
2	Questions, comments for Staff? Motions?
3	MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman?
4	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, sir.
5	MR. BROWN: The church is already there and they're just changing the purpose,
6	or they're changing the use of the facility that is currently there. And so I don't see
7	where this is gonna be detrimental to anything as I see it, and therefore I move that 17-
8	042 MA be forwarded to Council with a recommendation of approval.
9	MS. FRIERSON: I second.
10	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: And that's based on – did Staff get – yeah.
11	MS. HEGLER: What I got was that the opinion of use would not be detrimental
12	but –
13	MR. BROWN: No, it really doesn't change the use.
14	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: To the area. Okay? Alright, it's been moved and
15	properly seconded that we send Case No. 17-042 MA forward to Council with a
16	recommendation of approval per Mr., Commissioner Brown's recommendations and
17	comments. All in favor signify by raising your hand?
18	MR. PRICE: Those in favor: Greenleaf, Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown.
19	[Approved: Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown, Greenleaf; Absent: Yip, McLaurin,
20	Anderson, Tuttle]
21	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: And those opposed? Okay, we are a recommending
22	Body to County Council and they'll meet back in these Chambers on the 19 <sup>th</sup> . Thank
23	you guys. Alrighty.

1

MS. HEGLER: Those were done by consent.

MR. PRICE: Consent on 43 and 17-44.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: 17-45 now, yeah.

#### CASE NO. 17-045 MA:

5 MR. PRICE: So right now we're on item 17-045 MA. The Applicant is Jesse Bray, 6 the location is at the corner of Johnson Marina Road and Forrest Shealy Road. The 7 Applicant has a request to rezone almost an 82 acre tract area from Rural to RS-E. 8 Based on – Staff's recommendation was for approval of this request. This is based on 9 that we feel it's consistent with the objectives of the Comprehensive Plan, which 10 according to the Plan the zoning district per most characteristics and development 11 identify within a low-density future land use recommendations and the RS-E zoning 12 designation does support that type of development.

13 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, any questions for the Staff? Again, we do have 14 some persons signed up to speak. And if you are signed up to speak and if you hear 15 that your comments have already been reflected by someone else, you certainly have 16 the option to speak but if you choose to say, 'I concur with that person', feel free to do 17 that. So you certainly have that option. The Applicant, Jordan Hammond, DR Horton? 18 Please give us your name and your address for the Record.

19

#### TESTIMONY OF JORDAN HAMMOND:

MR. HAMMOND: Hey, I'm Jordan Hammond, I live at 133 Seven Drive in
Chapin, that's in this district. We're prepared otherwise but I would request, and I
apologize for the late notice, request a deferral. We just had lunch with our engineers.
They had a meeting Friday with Richland Utilities about additional upgrades to the

1	sewer capacity. We're prepared to go forward today, but we would request that you
2	grant us a deferral, if we can continue meetings with Richland Utilities on the sewer
3	department side.
4	MS. HEGLER: That's up to you as an action.
5	MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman?
6	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, sir, Mr. Brown?
7	MR. BROWN: I move deferral.
8	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, is there a second on that?
9	MR. GREENLEAF: Second.
10	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Alright. Okay, well it's been moved and – is there a
11	question on it?
12	MR. HAMMOND: Okay, thank y'all and I apologize for –
13	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Hold one second, please.
14	MR. PRICE: Who seconded?
15	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Mr. Greenleaf did. But Ms. Cairns had a question.
16	MS. CAIRNS: I'm just, I mean, we've had a lotta people come to speak on this.
17	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yeah.
18	MS. CAIRNS: And I, cause it would still come back before us. But there's –
19	MR. HAMMOND: I'm fine to go forward. I've asked for a deferral so we can
20	continue meetings with sewer utilities, but if – I don't wanna be disrespectful to
21	everybody's time.
22	MS. CAIRNS: I mean, the question of rezoning is a different question than the
23	question of sewer capacity.

1	MR. HAMMOND: Well, you're kinda stealing my thunder. I think some of the
2	people here are gonna have issues with the sewer capacity. We've had multiple
3	meetings with the property owners and they've addressed those issues. But I agree with
4	you, so I'm fine to go forward but however y'all wanna handle it.
5	MS. CAIRNS: Just cause, I mean, it's my understanding and I think Staff will
6	concur that if, even if we rezone it if they couldn't get the sewer capacity nothing's
7	gonna get built under the zoning if it can't be capacitized. You like that? I'm a lawyer, I
8	get to make up words. [Laughter]
9	MR. HAMMOND: I'm prepared to go forward if y'all insist.
10	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Well, we have a motion and a second on the table.
11	MR. GREENLEAF: Or have a tie vote cause I have to leave, sir, I'm sorry, Mr.
12	Chairman.
13	MR. BROWN: Let me just –
14	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Well, we have a Commissioner that may have to leave.
15	MR. GREENLEAF: It's our open enrollment in Medicare and that's what I do for a
16	living so I gotta go make some money and help people. Sorry about that.
17	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: That be the case we will lose our quorum.
18	MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman, can we ask if those folks who have come, if they, if
19	they have any problem with the deferral and can they come back?
20	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Everybody okay with that? Okay.
21	AUDIENCE: I object to the deferral.
22	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Well –
23	MR. GREENLEAF: [Inaudible] I can read the testimony later.

	35
1	MS. CAIRNS: Well, it doesn't work that way.
2	MR. GREENLEAF: Okay.
3	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Well, why don't we take a vote on the deferral while
4	you're here?
5	[Inaudible discussion]
6	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Excuse me one second, sir. We – there's a motion on
7	the table, we need to entertain that motion and then we can –
8	MS. CAIRNS: I would offer in terms of the deferral that I am saddened by the
9	fact, but if we're gonna lose a quorum, we're gonna lose a quorum.
10	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Right.
11	MS. CAIRNS: And I'm very disappointed. I, I completely appreciate the time that
12	you guys take to get here. And I also wanna hear from you all. And I can tell you that I'm
13	not exactly sure, I think almost everybody's here so we've got a good amount of
14	testimony and if Mr. Greenleaf needs to leave we lose our quorum. So we could deny
15	the deferral but it wouldn't, we wouldn't be able to vote on it anyways.
16	MR. GREENLEAF: Mr. Chairman, is there any way possible you could still take
17	the testimony of the community and that I could read it later for –
18	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: We can't without having a quorum, sorry. Can't do it.
19	MR. GREENLEAF: Oh. So sorry, folks.
20	MS. HEGLER: You can't take an action.
21	MS. CAIRNS: Yeah, we can't take an action.
22	MR. GREENLEAF: We can, I can read.

1	MS. CAIRNS: No, but we can't, I mean, we have to take a vote here, you have to
2	be here for the testimony.
3	MR. GREENLEAF: We can vote later. We can vote another time.
4	MS. CAIRNS: It doesn't work –
5	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Can't do it that way.
6	MR. GREENLEAF: Why not?
7	MS. CAIRNS: It's just not the way that boards work.
8	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: That's just not the way it works. Yeah, we –
9	MR. GREENLEAF: Medicare open enrollment doesn't end unfortunately, I'm
10	sorry.
11	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: We certainly honor your time and we, unfortunately
12	have to make that decision. It's a tough one for us to not have to have you come back.
13	That's always an issue.
14	AUDIENCE: [Inaudible]
15	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yeah.
16	AUDIENCE: [Inaudible]
17	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: We have a motion on the table and we need to
18	entertain that motion, Commissioners. And then we can have a discussion afterwards.
19	So there's a motion on the table to defer this case until the next Commission meeting.
20	And so all in favor –
21	MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman?
22	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay.

	37
1	MR. BROWN: I think the question was can they come back, not just around the
2	sewer issue but the project itself. Is that –
3	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Well the whole project will be deferred, yeah.
4	MR. BROWN: The whole project will be before us.
5	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yeah. So the whole thing would be deferred.
6	MR. BROWN: Yes.
7	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes.
8	MR. BROWN: Not just the sewer.
9	MS. CAIRNS: This matter will have to come back before us again.
10	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Come back before us. Completely.
11	MR. PRICE: Just to let them know, if this is, if this case is deferred we'll go
12	through the same process again where we will advertise in the newspaper and we will
13	post the property and hopefully you all will get some type of letter if you live within a
14	certain range of this property notifying you of the meeting.
15	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes. Motion on the table is to defer. All in favor please
16	signify by raising your hand.
17	MR. PRICE: Those in favor: Greenleaf, Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown.
18	[Approved: Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown, Greenleaf; Absent: Yip, McLaurin,
19	Anderson, Tuttle]
20	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. And we will see you guys back here. We'll make
21	sure you get notified about it.
22	MR. PRICE: Go ahead and do an adjournment while y'all have everybody here.
23	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Alright, so let's formally adjourn since we're here.

	38
1	MS. CAIRNS: And we lose our quorum.
2	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Motion to adjourn.
3	MR. PRICE: Oh, sorry. Mr. –
4	MS. CAIRNS: I was gonna say, is there any business we can conduct outside of
5	a quorum? In terms of the administrative matters that we have before us.
6	MS. HEGLER: We have one administrative question for you, which is –
7	MS. CAIRNS: The calendar and time.
8	MS. HEGLER: - to adopt your calendar, time and I think on your calendar it
9	indicates not meeting in January.
10	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yeah, we can cause I was gonna suggest that.
11	MS. CAIRNS: I was gonna say cause the two, yeah in terms of –
12	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Excuse me one second. Yeah, if you will, for those of
13	you who wanna have a conversation, we've got a little bit more business to wrap up so
14	if you would please step out and have your conversations we certainly would appreciate
15	that. And we'll be wrapped up here in a minute if you wanna have a conversation with
16	us. Okay? Alright.
17	MS. CAIRNS: In terms of the Planning Commission meetings for next month.
18	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Somebody left their keys here by the way.
19	MS. CAIRNS: Cool. Looks like a nice car.
20	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: So if you get outside and realize you can't drive your
21	car I have your keys. So if you'll take your conversations outside for us we certainly
22	would appreciate that so we can continue our business. Okay, go ahead.

		l
1	MS. HEGLER: I believe you have a calendar to adopt for 2018 which most	
2	importantly includes not meeting in January. That you need to – or December. No, it is	
3	December, it's January, good grief. Obviously, potentially not having next month's	
4	meeting, you do need to definitely act on that or we'll need to –	
5	MS. CAIRNS: Is there a reason why we don't have a January meeting?	
6	MS. HEGLER: So Council does not take action other than their retreat in	
7	January. They meet once to name a Chair and do their seats and have their retreat, so	
8	they won't be taking up any zoning business. So there's really – whatever you took up in	
9	January still wouldn't be heard by Council until February. But of course, you can choose	
10	otherwise.	
11	MS. CAIRNS: Okay.	
12	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay.	
13	MS. CAIRNS: So in August, isn't it typical that we leave August on and then	
14	cancel it later if indeed there's not gonna be a –	
15	MS. HEGLER: That is true.	
16	MS. CAIRNS: - public meeting as well. And I would like to offer to the	
17	Commission, as small as it may be right now, is that we move the 1:00 meetings until	
18	3:00. Most of our meetings are short enough I think we'd be getting done in the	
19	business hours and I think that that would, I would hope aid the public in coming. But I	
20	think it would aid some of the Commissioners, it would aid me with trying to work as	
21	well.	
22	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: That is certainly something that we've championed	
23	here to try to move the time, so is that something we need to vote on?	

	40
1	MS. HEGLER: Yeah.
2	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Along with the calendar?
3	MS. HEGLER: Yes, sir.
4	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: But I'm all in favor of that. Starting in February, yes.
5	Um-hum.
6	MS. CAIRNS: Well, if there's no opposition basically I move that we adopt the
7	2018 Planning Commission meeting calendar as offered, including not meeting in
8	January.
9	MR. PRICE: I'm sorry, there're two dates on there and I apologize cause I
10	[inaudible] don't have before me, but you'll notice that there're two months that they
11	have two dates before you on there, and so you have to, if you would decide –
12	MS. HEGLER: June and November.
13	MR. PRICE: - the first, yeah the first dates, Council Chambers will be used by the
14	elections so this room would not be available, so that would kind of force us to find an
15	alternative site. However, if we move it to the second date that you have on there the
16	only issue with that, it does run really close to the Zoning Public hearing but that, you
17	know, we've had that happen before.
18	MS. CAIRNS: My preference would be that we leave it on the 1 <sup>st</sup> Monday
19	whenever possible and move the location rather than move the calendar date. Okay, so
20	I'll make my motion to approve the meeting using the first Monday of the month, except
21	for obviously July which has already been moved which is good. And then shifting the
22	meeting time beginning with the February meeting till 3:00 in the afternoon.
23	MR. PRICE: Okay.

	71
1	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, it's been moved and properly seconded – I
2	mean moved.
3	MR. GREENLEAF: Second.
4	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Alright. All in favor?
5	MR. PRICE: Those in favor: Greenleaf, Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, and Brown.
6	[Approved: Frierson, Cairns, Gilchrist, Brown, Greenleaf; Absent: Yip, McLaurin,
7	Anderson, Tuttle]
8	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: I was trying to get us through the whole Agenda, y'all.
9	So we could get through.
10	MR. GREENLEAF: So sorry.
11	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: That's alright. I understand.
12	MS. CAIRNS: Motion to adjourn?
13	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Well, we got –
14	MS. HEGLER: Well, we can do informational stuff after, that's the last of the
15	action items, right?
16	MS. CAIRNS: Yeah.
17	MS. FRIERSON: Are we going to be able to at least propose the change to this?
18	Cause I would imagine we'd have to have three readings anyway.
19	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Articles, is that right? Yes. Yes, we will be able to
20	propose changes to –
21	MS. HEGLER: You can propose changes. It does not go before Council though,
22	it does not require three readings.
23	MS. CAIRNS: These are our rules?

	42
1	MR. PRICE: Yeah, those are your rules.
2	MS. FRIERSON: Our rules.
3	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yeah, we don't to do three readings, do we?
4	MS. HEGLER: No, sir.
5	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: No. So, so we're good. Let's just make those
6	recommendations and send them in.
7	MS. HEGLER: You need to adjourn before you lose Mr. Greenleaf.
8	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay.
9	MS. CAIRNS: No, we – I would just as soon hear and then we can vote on them,
10	I would imagine the next time we –
11	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Let's just then adjourn while Greenleaf is here. Alright?
12	Where'd he go? Alright, well we can – I guess, can we still conduct business since he's
13	here?
14	MS. HEGLER: Sure. So, what's next? The Land Development Code rewrite. You
15	have in front of you a printout of the consultant's assessment of our current Code. Okay,
16	Staff has already reviewed that, provided some feedback, they've made those changes,
17	and now we're vetting it through you and we'll get with our stakeholders, probably in the
18	New Year to go over that with them. By the end of the year we hope to, however, have
19	a draft memo that highlights some of the bigger items that came out of their assessment
20	of our current Code. So that'll be forthcoming in written form and then we'll start gearing
21	up with some public meetings and meetings with our consultants in the New Year.
22	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Great.

1	MS. FRIERSON: Question. When we do consider this will we have it sent in
2	sections or as a whole document?
3	MS. HEGLER: Yeah, you know, I think we can do that anyway that you would
4	prefer. I think it's probably – certainly for review I will have you look at it in pieces and
5	portions. In terms of adoption probably as the whole document. But you could even
6	choose to maybe do that in sections as well. But we will bring you sections to review.
7	MS. FRIERSON: Thank you.
8	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay.
9	MS. CAIRNS: I would imagine the creating of something of this magnitude is a
10	rather organic process. Yeah.
11	MS. HEGLER: It's really however you feel most comfortable. So sure, if we're in
12	the middle of it and you kinda wanna change the pace or the position then that's, I think
13	we're flexible. So no action on the Code rewrite, just information.
14	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. Is the –
15	MS. CAIRNS: Ms. Frierson had some changes she wanted to offer for our Rules
16	of Procedure. I'd just be curious to hear.
17	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: And we can end the, we can email those to Staff, is
18	that right?
19	MS. HEGLER: Um-hum (affirmative).
20	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: For purposes of consideration. Or do you wanna talk
21	about them now?
22	MS. FRIERSON: It's just one.
23	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Oh! Okay.

MS. FRIERSON: And it's something that we mentioned at the last meeting. CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Oh, okay.

MS. FRIERSON: Just real quick.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Well, you can go ahead and tell them that, yeah.

MS. FRIERSON: Okay. On page 6 of our current Rules I propose that we have a new letter (e) to read as follows: The Applicant may have up to three minutes to rebut comments made during the discussion period. And this is in reference to what we discussed at the last meeting near the end about sometimes the unfairness of a situation wherein unfortunately some of the testimony that we hear sometimes deteriorates into personal attacks and it's only fair that the Applicant get a chance to rebut and that's what I propose. And then if that is passed then we would just need to reorder the last few letters to become a new, you know, (e), yeah (f) and (g).

MR. BROWN: Mr. Chairman, I have no objection to what Ms. Frierson has said,
but I think the Chair needs to tell folks that we will not entertain personal attacks. Either
on the Applicant, the persons who are in opposition or in favor of, what is being
proposed, or on the Commission. And that the Chair needs to just rule them out of order
and set them down.

18 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: We certainly can do that, Mr. Brown. Thought I was
19 gonna have to do that today. Yeah. She said I missed the gavel, I hit the table –
20 MS. HEGLER: Do not mess up that table.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: I know the new table. [Laughter] No, but thank you for
that. Appreciate it.

1

1	MS. HEGLER: Ms. Frierson, we have noted that and can start to draft edits and
2	track changes that will start to float through.
3	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: That'd be good. Alright. Is there – so Chairman's
4	Report? Just – the only thing that I wanted to just bring to the attention was the issue of
5	changing the time to 3:00. And also, you know, at our next meeting we can talk about
6	the update that we had on the –
7	MS. HEGLER: You need him before you adjourn.
8	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: No, we're – Ed, hold up. Motion to adjourn.
9	MR. BROWN: So moved.
10	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, thank you, Ed. Merry Christmas.
11	MR. GREENLEAF: Merry Christmas. Happy New Year.
12	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay, get outta here now, you say you had to go.
13	[Laughter] Okay, but on the Chairman's Report I guess I can just wait until next month
14	to do that.
15	MS. HEGLER: You can continue to discuss, you just can't end a meeting without
16	a quorum.
17	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Take action. Well, I – one of the things that I wanted to
18	mention to you all, I know we've talked about this transparency thing about, you know,
19	does the public have access to our information about, things that they are concerned
20	about or wanna reach us in some manner. And I think Tracy may have an update from
21	the administrator about that conversation and kinda where that's been going, so I just
22	wanted to make sure everybody has an update on where we are with that.

1 MS. HEGLER: Yes, so there're a number of option. You know, currently we have 2 a Planning Commission email address that comes to the County, so if somebody were 3 to email that, we share and disseminate the information with you. Certainly calls or 4 emails we get that are appropriate to forward to you, we do. So that's how we've been 5 handling getting information to you. Currently we do not have, say your personal 6 information for contact on our website. There are some commissions who do. They 7 have their phone numbers and their personal email addresses if somebody from the 8 public wanted to reach them, that's how they would do it. So I think that was kind of the 9 genesis of the request from Mr. Gilchrist was how you would be more accessible to 10 citizens if they needed. So an option is, you all probably have personal email addresses 11 you could authorize us to publish that. We spoke to IT about issuing an .rcgov address 12 which is our internal email, but for security purposes to keep folks out of the firewall we 13 would want to provide you with a device; phone, tablet or laptop, that we would control 14 because if we gave you that address on your system, your phone or your computer, 15 there would, you know, potentially be backdoor access into our system. So that's the 16 only option available in terms of using an .rcgov address is to give you as well a device 17 for accessing that. That's doable, Administrator Seals has agreed to do that. What I 18 don't know, and it's kind of the next iteration of the conversation is whether we would 19 make that mandatory of you as a volunteer, or optional. I'm sure optional probably 20 makes sense, but kinda taking it to the next level. I don't know the answer to that but I 21 do know he's amenable to providing that device to you should that be the direction we 22 take. So there's a lotta different options out there in terms of how accessible you wanna be to the public, the most secure being that .rcgov but having you – you'd be issued a
 County device to do so.

3 MS. CAIRNS: I guess, I just would be curious, I mean, could there be in essence 4 an email address that was given out that was like something fancy like 5 planningcommission@rcgov.whatever, and that it would then internally relay out to all of 6 the Planning Commission Members' personal emails? 7 MS. HEGLER: So I would've hoped that that would've been suggested to us, I 8 mean, cause we know, IT knew what we were trying to do. But one thing I did talk to Mr. 9 Gilchrist about earlier is wondering if there is a way – I still don't think that, I was 10 thinking could you even access that planningcommission@rcgov, but you can't. 11 MS. CAIRNS: But just to have it, but to have you guys, you know, have someone 12 IT, you know, do an automatic relay? Cause there are times – 13 MS. HEGLER: We're basically doing that now. But we're doing that physically 14 currently, that's how we're getting information to you. 15 MS. CAIRNS: No, I know, but – I guess. I mean, cause when people – I get 16 found, you know, and so you know, I always find it a little bit odd when I meet with or 17 listen to applicants outside of the Body, you know, so that's partly why, it's like, if – I get 18 what you're saying is that basically if you say the person writes to me I'll forward it. Do you ever get the sense from the public that they don't like that? That they wanna reach 19 20 us directly? 21 MS. HEGLER: I'm gonna look at Tommy and Geo, I don't – 22 MS. CAIRNS: Cause you're right, what I'm proposing would be the exact same 23 thing. But they do, it sounds like they do sometimes wanna reach us individually.

1 MS. HEGLER: And then I think they go, they find you. I mean, you can be found. 2 I mean, I know you guys are getting contacted. But to that degree I would suggest that if 3 you have an active email account we could publicize that. For instance, the 4 Conservation Commissioners do that, just whatever their home -5 MS. CAIRNS: Basically we could, I could become 6 heather.planningcommissioner@gmail.com. 7 MS. HEGLER: You could, right. Right, if you wanted to create one -8 MS. CAIRNS: And then give you that one. 9 MS. HEGLER: Correct. Absolutely. That's what I would probably recommend 10 doing if you didn't want a new device. 11 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Let me also go back to remind the Commission why 12 this came up. None of our information currently exists on the website, nothing. So part 13 of what this whole conversation was about was how do we ensure that if the public 14 wants to reach any of the Commissioners that they have the ability to be able to do that. 15 So I think at one of our last Commission meetings we had a conversation about whether 16 or not we wanted to provide our own personal information, very similar to the 17 Conservation Commission, to put it there, or if we wanted to look at some way of 18 looking at an .rcgov thing, one of our Commissioners brought that up as a recommendation. So I think that's part of where our Planning Director's coming from on 19 20 that. So -21 MR. PRICE: I guess to answer one of the questions that I think you posed just a 22 second ago, Tommy correct me if you hear differently. Most of the time when somebody 23 wants to get information to the Planning Commission they want to get it to you as a

Body, that's why you'll always – we'll give you nine envelopes or letters or something cause it's typically to the Body. Very seldom do we hear, I need to get in contact with one particular Member, and we've found in some cases if they do want to get in contact with an individual Member it's usually somebody they know so there's a reason why they're going to that person and they have other ways to reach them. So just to let you know just the history of it, it's always for the Body. Very seldom do we get, that I can remember that someone said, "Just get this to the Chair only" or to a particular Member.

8 MS. CAIRNS: But it is interesting to wonder whether, does the public feel stymied 9 that we don't have any contact info on the website. Cause it is so typical to have 10 something.

11 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Yes, I've heard that. Which is why we brought it up. 12 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Mr. Chairman, as a private individual I'm trying to say 13 something to you folks, I need your help, man. I've got raw sewerage in my backyard, 14 242,000 parts per million of e-coli in my backyard. And it's running all down the side, 15 running into Lake Murray. And think of the economic downturn on this community if 16 Lake Murray were depleted. If the EPA stepped in and said you can't use it anymore. 17 Not only my backyard but the whole area here, and it's happening, and nobody wants to 18 listen. I've been to everybody.

19 CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: I tell you what, before I get outta here we'll make sure 20 we find somebody that you can talk to about that. How about that? So give me one 21 second, we're gonna wrap this up and we'll do that.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Thank you, sir.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: So that's the deal on that.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

22

MS. HEGLER: So I would think it's up to you to decide how you wanna go about doing that. Certainly I can talk to IT about having the automatic forwarding, but it would be forwarding to your personal address is just like we are currently manually doing.

MS. CAIRNS: That makes sense. I mean, I think the idea that the County would have to provide to us or to me a device just seems wasteful. And so I think that, I think it's more just, you know, as we start a year to say, you know, to suggest the gmail, like just come up with a gmail account that we'll put on there, or whoever your favorite provider is.

9 MS. HEGLER: And we'd be happy to help you establish that. It would just be,
10 obviously you would wanna know your own –

MS. CAIRNS: But I mean, but I guess that's just the thing is, you know, to
consider the, you know, it's the way we all work anymore is we go on the Internet, we
find our information and we wanna be able to communicate by email. And even on that,
even on the site that says, you know, if you wanna send something to all Commission
Members click here, it would go to one of you guys. And if you wanna write to some
individual, just so that we don't look like we're trying to hide.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Right.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

17

18

19

MS. CAIRNS: You know, cause some of us might be harder to find than others. In terms of if somebody wanted to get a hold of us specifically.

20 MS. HEGLER: So I mean, it's a lot of options.

CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: I don't know if the County is exploring whether or not
all commissions should be in a position to look at doing the same thing, so. Cause I

1	know a County Councilman brought that up to me, that all commissions, that we
2	authorize, should have their information so that the public can reach them.
3	MS. HEGLER: Yeah, I don't know how that's being handled, but probably so.
4	And I do know that we're looking at our technology and updating it and that's kind of a
5	question in there. I would suggest that whatever we do we would at least propose it to
6	all the other boards and commissions and leave that to their discretion, unless they
7	made it mandatory, but. But I'll float that question around as well.
8	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Okay. And we can chop it back up next year. Alright.
9	Merry Christmas everybody.
10	MR. BROWN: Happy New Year.
11	MS. HEGLER: You too.
12	CHAIRMAN GILCHRIST: Happy New Year, all that good stuff. I'll see you in just
13	a second. Thank y'all.
14	
15	[Meeting adjourned at 2:45pm]